

Municipality of Tweed Document Digitization Report

September 2020



Contact

Hassan (Hash) Qureshi, Partner, Enterprise Risk Services MNP LLP 7 Hinton Avenue North, Suite 100 Ottawa, Ontario K1Y 4P1 T : 613–863–4274 | E : hash.qureshi@mnp.ca



Limitations of Our Work

The work conducted as part of this engagement with the Municipality of Tweed was advisory in nature and did not constitute an assurance engagement following Generally Accepted Auditing Standards (GAAS) or a fraud investigation or a forensic review. The findings and results of our engagement are based on the information shared by the Municipality of Tweed. We did not independently verify or audit the completeness and accuracy of information provided by the Municipality of Tweed as part of the engagement. We acknowledge that an alternative service provider with different resources performing a review at a different point in time may have different results.

Table of Contents

Execu	itive Summary	4
1. Intr	roduction	5
2. Wh	hat we found	5
2.1	Records Information Life Cycle Wide Pain Points	6
2.2	Records Information Life Cycle Stages Pain Points	8
1.	Collection, Creation, or Receipt	8
2.	Organization and Classification	9
3.	Storage	9
4.	Retrieval/Dissemination	10
5.	Disposition/Destruction	11
2.3	Current State – Cost Analysis	11
2.4	Key Dependencies in the Pursuit of Records Management Modernization	12
3. Rec	commended Opportunities to Improve	14
4. Imp	plementation Roadmap and Prioritization Framework	21
Apper	ndix A – Our Approach and Methodology	23
Apper	ndix B – Glossary of Terms	29
Apper	ndix C – Detailed Information Lifecycle Table	
Apper	ndix D – Cost Estimation Breakdown	
Apper	ndix E – List of Internal Stakeholders Involved	

Executive Summary

Using funding from the Ontario Municipal Modernization Program, the Municipality of Tweed (or the "Municipality") has decided to modernize their current records management processes through automation, optimization, and digitization of their records. Currently the Municipality's processes are primarily paper based, manual, and aren't standardized across all departments. The Municipality has also noted that their records retention policy has not been updated since 2002 and several other policies have not been updated since 2006.

The Municipality engaged MNP to conduct a third-party review of their current retention by-laws and filing strategies. The Municipality's departments involved with this assessment included: Corporate Services and Administration, Treasury, Public Works, Community Development and Recreation, Fire Department, Tax Services and By-Law Council. To better understand the current records management processes and identify opportunities to increase efficiency, decrease long term costs, and identify opportunities for document digitization, MNP utilized the information lifecycle management framework for their assessment. This assessment set out to examine and understand the Municipality's records management process through the following 5 key stages:

- A. Collection, Creation, or Receipt of Record
- B. Organization and Classification
- C. Storage
- D. Retrieval and Dissemination
- E. Disposition and Destruction

Through this assessment, MNP identified 16 pain points and challenges related to the current records management processes. MNP also identified 8 opportunities for improvement that could address the identified pain points while also resulting in long term cost savings. These opportunities for improvement are listed at a high level below and represent initiatives to drive short and medium benefits:

- 1. Multi-year technology strategy
- 2. Infrastructure investment
- 3. Change management plan
- 4. Records management modernization plan
- 5. CGSB Standards
- 6. Standardized classification schema
- 7. Business continuity and disaster recovery
- 8. Develop and implement document digitization strategy

MNP anticipates that if the above opportunities are implemented by the Municipality, there is a high probability of an increase in 7-10 % operating efficiency resulting in annualized savings of \$35-\$45 K in the first 3 months. After the first year, when it is expected that all 8 of MNPs recommendations have been implemented, operational productivity may increase by 12-16% and the annualized saving could be between \$56-\$72 K. If the Municipality continues a long term and continuous improvement digitization strategy, MNP expects that operational efficiency could be improved up to 15-20% which could result in annualized savings between \$70-90K. The Municipality would be able to more readily take full advantage of a digital environment allowing centralization and workflow automation and easier collaboration both internally and externally beyond organizational boundaries. MNP expects these initiatives to enable the Municipality to demonstrate a modernized cost effective and citizen-centric service.

1. Introduction

The Municipal Modernization Program, delivered through the Ministry of Municipal Affairs and Housing, was first issued in March 2019 to provide funding to 405 small and rural municipalities in Ontario. The goal of the program is to aid municipalities with expenditures to find service delivery efficiencies and lower costs in the long term. An additional application-focused program was released in November 2019 and approved in March 2020 to help fund the implementation phase of municipal modernization initiatives. Now that this program is available, the Municipality of Tweed (or the "Municipality"), an amalgamated municipality located in central-eastern Ontario in Hastings County would like to leverage this program to modernize the Municipality's filing strategies and records management systems which is currently mostly paper based, manual, and out-dated. The Municipality is seeking to identify opportunities for document digitization, cost savings, and to create efficiencies in their records management systems and the related operational processes.

The Municipality, using funding from the provincial program, has engaged MNP ("us" or "we") to conduct a third-party review of their current retention by-laws and filing strategies to move to a more digital and automated approach while also identifying areas that when modernized will lead to efficiencies and cost effective operations.

As a third-party reviewer, our objectives were to:

- Identify options for digitizing documents and standardizing filing systems across the various municipal departments
- Identify opportunities to improve efficiencies of the Municipality's filing processes
- Identify long term cost savings in filing processes

Our assessment conducted between June and August 2020 was focused on examining the Municipality's current state filing activities and retention by–laws. Our approach is presented in detail under Appendix A, Approach. The findings and recommendations presented within this report, can be used by the Municipality to develop and action a modernization program that addresses operational pain points and opportunities for improvement while also reducing risk of data loss and increased control while costs to operate are optimized.

2. What we found

For organizations to have efficient, effective operations, staff need to be able to access data and information reliably and in a timely manner. Oftentimes, this involves a centralized, easy to access, and easily searchable records inventory. The inventory enabled by the records management technology should provide access to digitized data, reports, and documentation necessary to effectively enable regular operations. Currently the Municipality is lacking a central electronic record filing system, as well as the technology to convert hard copies to digital records while meeting requirements for admissibility as legal evidence1 (CAN/CGSB 72.34-2005). There are also limitations on the ability to search, index and retrieve these records efficiently and effectively. Additionally, the related processes lack automation, consistency, and have not been updated since they were first introduced. An outdated process means it is likely no longer usable or suitable for the purpose it was initially made for. These aspects of the current state are causing operational pain points at all stages of the Municipality's records information lifecycle. A more detailed description of what each of the records information lifecycle stages are can be found in Appendix A – Our Approach.

¹ CAN/CGSB 72.34-2005

2.1 Records Information Life Cycle Wide Pain Points

During the consultations conducted, we observed that there were several pain points that appeared across all stages of the records information life cycle and we refer to these as "life cycle wide pain points".

As outlined in Appendix A, the records information life cycle can be depicted below:



In this section, we discuss the following pain points that span the entire information lifecycle:

- Current records management processes are heavily paper based
- Lack of standardization of records management across departments
- Lack of formalized records management policies and procedures

Current records management processes are heavily paper based

We found that the municipality currently has 11 different storage locations and 60 different record types (by-law, zoning, amendments, etc.), with most documents are stored in hard copy.



Legend:

- Hard copy
- Digitized with legal substance
- Digitized without legal substance
- Electronic

Exhibit 1 displays the total number of record types by each department showing the number of documents in each category (state that the records were stored as). It was observed that the only department that currently digitizes records that may be used in a court of law (legal proceedings) is the Corporate Services and Administration department. The chart also shows that most departments currently store most of their records as hard copies, and very few records are digitized. The corporate services and the treasury departments were identified as the 2 departments with most records stored as a hard copy.

There are several instances where reliance on hard copy records storage leads to is causing operational pain points for the Municipality. The main pain point reported regarding the heavy reliance on hard copy records is the time-consuming nature of manually generating, utilizing, searching for, and retrieving hard copies. Some various examples of hard copy-based processing and records include the use of income tax receipts, timesheets, fire log reports, and the municipal facility booking systems. All these records are executed through hard copy-based intake, processing, utilization, storage, and document retrieval and we were told each of these processes is very time consuming. Additional pain points due to reliance on hard copy records are elaborated on throughout section 2.1.

Lack of standardization of records management across departments

It was noted that several of the records management and storage processes have not been standardized across the departments. Employees have versions of files on their individual drives and use their own developed practices and methods to store documents. This causes operational pain points such as inefficiencies when other employees are trying to access these records, delays in retrieval, version controls issues, and the risk of losing valuable documentation.

Lack of formalized records management policies and procedures

Aside from a retention policy, there are no defined records management policies or procedures. Currently there is no direction provided to guide records storage efforts which causes staff to encounter difficulties keeping track of information since they are developing their own individual practices for records storage. Staff currently develop their own classification schemes, which causes inefficiencies for record retrieval and collection across departments when other staff members attempt to search and retrieve those records. Without any defined polices or procedures for records management, it also becomes very difficult to identify what records are outdated and/or have outlived their usefulness. Lastly, it was noted that there is no procedure to identify records that have reached the end of their lifecycle and no longer need to be retained. The retention of these documents leads to excessive, unnecessary, and redundant storage of records.

2.2 Records Information Life Cycle Stages Pain Points

The following section outlines various pain points that appear throughout the lifecycle, but that are specific to each stage.



1. Collection, Creation, or Receipt

During this stage of the lifecycle, records are first created, collected, or received in several ways. We noted these specific pain points relevant to this first stage:

- Inefficient records intake channels and processes
- Redundant records generation

Inefficient records intake channels and processes

We understand that the municipality's processes to engage the community are almost entirely paperbased. This means that the information once collected must be transposed into electronic systems or worse yet, other hard-copy and manual processes. At each transposition there is a higher risk of creating errors, omissions and increase data redundancy (or "data smog"²). As an example, the Fire Department, only two computers have the Fire Pro application that tracks their incident records. Notes are handwritten and re-keyed into the Fire Pro application when the main users are not at their workstations. This causes inefficiencies, keying errors, delays to records generation, and duplication of efforts across the department due to the lack of proper infrastructure available for all staff.

Another example is when income tax receipts from donations come in the form of cheques, which are photocopied to process later. There is often not enough or too much information stored in either the

² "Data smog" is an overwhelming excess of information that makes finding the "right" information difficult

hard copy receipts or the captured photocopies. This causes inefficiencies and additional effort for the tax department to retrieve the require information.

Redundant records generation

We heard of instances where documents may be received in electronic form, only to be printed and stored as hard copies. This leads to extra effort for a largely redundant storage of records (again increasing data smog) and it also is harder to search and locate since only manual inspection of the hard copies is possible when looking for information, which is very time consuming. The increased redundancy also introduces the risk of not knowing which record or form is to be relied upon (is authoritative) when required for retrieval. Since people are not sure when and how they can locate information they need, we understand that most employees create their own filing systems and approaches to preserve what they consider is important. An example of the this occurs when the Municipality receives electronic invoices. The current process is that the invoices are printed and stored as hard copies in addition to storage of the electronic versions received. Another example occurs in the process used for energy reporting to the province. We noted that within this process there are cases where emails and invoices are printed, and they are kept as hard copies with no apparent limit for the volume that are being stored in this manner.



2. Organization and Classification

During this stage of the lifecycle, records are then organized and classified. The pain point reported below is relevant to this second stage:

No formalized or standardized classification schema

No formalized or standardized classification schema

It was noted that there is no standardized classification schema used for the storage of records, with several examples of employees developing and utilizing ad-hoc, largely manual driven solutions to organizing their records. Without standardization across departments for classification and retrieval of records, particularly when records need to be retrieved across departments, the retrieval process becomes labour intensive, time consuming, and overall inefficient.



3. Storage

During this stage of the lifecycle, records are stored depending on retention requirements and the classification schema. The pain points reported below are relevant to this third stage:

- No policies and procedures for business continuity and disaster recovery planning
- Insufficient storage capacity for digitized records

- Risk of damage to hard copy records
- Storage of record duplicates

No policies and procedures for business continuity and disaster recovery planning

Currently there are no policies/ procedures for business continuity and disaster recovery planning with regards to the retrieval of records in the case of a natural or human-induced disaster. The IT department does have a procedure in place to ensure regular and consistent backups of electronic files, however the procedure is not documented and does not satisfy the need for formal business continuity and disaster recovery planning. For policies and procedures to be effective they need to be well documented, updated, enforced, and communicated. If the municipality encounters a disaster, there should be policies and procedures in place to ensure that all their data and documentation is backed up and retrievable. Without relevant policies, procedures, and supporting architecture in place, there is a risk that the municipality would lose valuable data/information with no way to recover that data and ongoing operations may be significantly disrupted.

Insufficient storage capacity for digitized records

We heard that within the Tax department, the accounting software is at capacity in terms of the amount of data that they have stored. Staff must manually complete database repairs and compaction frequently to maintain the records storage. The system crashes often due to storage being overloaded, which risks the loss of data in the accounting software. The lack of supporting IT infrastructure for storage is a concern not just due to the risk to loss of data but when storage capacity is reached, oftentimes systems are not able to run efficiently, leading to processing delays for the retrieval of data.

Risk of damage to hard copy records

Records rooms located in the basement of the Municipality's main operations building are not climate controlled and there are common occurrences of flooding, which could risk damaging records. This could lead to potential loss of valuable data.

Storage of record duplicates

We heard of instances where the same records are stored in multiple places in multiple forms. This leads to redundant efforts for the storage of records and confusion in identifying original copies. An example of this pain point was observed in the email storage process where emails were printed and stored in different files. Another example noted was with water meter entries, which are manually retrieved, entered into the system, and then printed as a hard copy to be stored in multiple forms. It was also reported that energy reporting is usually photocopied and stored in multiple forms across multiple locations.



4. Retrieval/Dissemination

During this phase of the information lifecycle, records are retrieved and disseminated to be used for operational purposes. The pain points reported below are relevant to this fourth stage:

- Retrieval of hard copy records stored across many records rooms
- Dissemination and communication of Municipal policy documents

Retrieval of hard copy records stored across many records rooms

During our workshop we observed that multiple records are scattered across different storage spaces in different offices with no clear way to identify specific records that exist in each records room. Without a standardized classification schema as noted in pain point 6 and 7 above, the retrieval process becomes very labour intensive and time consuming.

Dissemination and communication of Municipal policy documents

The municipality's policies are stored in hard copy as a binder in multiple locations and several policies have not been updated since 2006. It was noted that some policies have been updated, with new policies added regarding the pandemic payroll policy, as well as the COVID water/sewer relief policy. For policies to be effective they need to be well documented, updated, enforced, and communicated. With the policies being stored only as a large hard copy binder, they may not be effectively communicated since it's more difficult for staff to locate them when compared to an online repository.



5. Disposition/Destruction

During this phase of the information lifecycle, records are then either retired and moved to an archive or they are destroyed depending on both the retention requirements and potential future use of the records. The pain point reported below are relevant to this fifth stage:

Lack of clear records retention and archive policies and procedures

Lack of clear records retention and archive policies and procedures

Very few records are disposed, and certain records are maintained in hard copy and electronic forms longer than required according to the retention schedules. It was also noted that there is no procedure in place to dispose of or retire records once they reach the end of their retention period. This process, or lack thereof, causes staff to spend more time searching for and retrieving records as there are greater volumes to search through. It also leads to lack of available physical and electronic storage space given the excessive storage of records. Lastly, it was noted that there is no formal procedure to identify the records that have reach the end of their lifecycle and no longer need to be retained, which leads to excessive, unnecessary, and redundant storage of records.

2.3 Current State – Cost Analysis

During our assessment, we completed a cost analysis of the current document management processes across the information management lifecycle stages. Estimated costs developed with the Municipality have been grouped into the following two categories:

- Direct costs: Includes the costs that can be directly tied to the information lifecycle, including costs for paper, printing, storage, shredding and scanning.
- Indirect costs: Based on the time/effort that staff allocate towards the information records lifecycle activities. The average time allocated by each department to the activities has been quantified to a

dollar value based on an estimate of the hourly wages (provided by the CAO/ Treasurer) for each department.

Based on the total direct and indirect costs calculated the total estimated cost allocated towards the current records management process was calculated to be around \$500,000 annually. The cost analysis concluded that over 90% of the current costs are labour costs related to the time spent on current records management processes. Given that the Municipality's current approach to records management is largely hard copy-based and heavily reliant on manual, ad-hoc processes, and given the several related operational pain points causing labour inefficiencies, the current cost of records management is largely due to associate labour costs, as shown in table 1. below.

Cost Estimation Table								
	Information Lifecycle Activities							
Annualized averages	1.2.Collection,OrganizationCreation, orandReceipt ofClassificationrecordsof records		3. Storage	4. Retrieval and Dissemination	5. Disposition & Destruction			
Direct Cost (\$)	17,834	8,555	10,192	15,253	946			
Time and effort (hrs)	4,104	2,232	3,298	3472	289			
Time and effort (\$)	133,117	72,330	115,449	116,970	8,456			
Total Direct & Indirect Costs	150,953	80,886	125,641	132,223	9,402			

Table 1. Cost Analysis Table estimating Combined Direct and Indirect Costs for the Information Lifecycle
--

Please note that the cost information was rounded to the nearest 10 dollars and additional cost details and assumptions taken can be found in **Appendix D.**

2.4 Key Dependencies in the Pursuit of Records Management Modernization

Given the operational pain points and the associated high % labour costs for records management, the Municipality has recognized the need for change and modernization. However, there are several core dependencies that must be considered for addressing while planning for and implementing the records modernization program.

Poor Internet Connectivity

The Municipality has recognized that part of an effective records management modernization is a focus on digitization of records, as well as the implementation of a supporting information technology system for records management. Such a system can drastically reduce manual efforts in document processing throughout the records information life cycle and thereby reduce ongoing associate labour costs. However, the Municipality is currently experiencing pain points related to its current IT infrastructure that must be addressed prior to the pursuit of additional technology to support a records management modernization effort.

Namely, there is poor internet connectivity in the Municipality's main office. Symptoms of the poor internet connections include frequent network down times and software crashing. Software crashes due to network connectivity increase the risk of loss of information. In addition to these current operational pain points and risks, many modern records management IT system solutions are cloud-based and therefore rely upon a sufficient and reliable internet connectivity to operate effectively. Without the appropriate network capacity, speed, and reliability, it would be difficult for the Municipality to reasonably pursue one of these options and expect it to operate effectively. Even if a cloud-based

solution was not pursued, poor internet connectivity is still likely to have impacts to any on-premise solution.

Records Management Requirements

The Municipality also has a retention by-law and several internal policies which must be adhered to within whatever document management system is developed. The requirements from this by-law and the policies for documentation retention are as follows:

- 1) By-Laws and policies must be approved and signed using ink signature and be kept as a hard copy indefinitely
- 2) Marriage and death records are retained in a ledger indefinitely
- 3) Tax certificates need to be kept for 7 years
- 4) Timesheets need to be signed off by managers, and stored for an appropriate time period so that external auditors can review them
- 5) With respect to the Fire Department, all data logs for report incidents are stored for an appropriate time period. The fire chief would need to retain this evidence for possible use in court
- 6) Physical Signatures are needed to sign off on monthly water sampling report that's created
- 7) A certified copy of by-laws needs to be made with an indent stamp of the municipal logo once complete and stored permanently.

As the Municipality pursues and ultimately implements its modern records management program, they will need to either:

- a) Align to the by-law requirements and policies or
- b) Consider updating these retention related requirements to align to the modern capabilities to be pursued.

3. Recommended Opportunities to Improve

In order to prepare for the development, implementation, and operationalization of a records management modernization program, that includes a supporting IT records management system, there are several opportunities for improvement that the Municipality should action. These opportunity areas are presented as follows in the table below. Where applicable, examples are provided of items we heard of during our consultations and our suggestions that would be suitable to action as part of the opportunities described. Within some of the opportunities we have also highlighted where improvements are dependent on actioning before or alongside other opportunity areas. Lastly, we have outlined the expected benefits the Municipality should expect to receive if they action any of the opportunities.

Opportunity for Improvement	Examples Items to Action	Expected Savings and Benefits
1. Multi-year technology strategy: The Municipality's goal of modernizing their records management processes is highly dependant on identifying and selecting the appropriate information technologies to digitize, classify, store, retrieve, and dispose of/retire records. Beyond simply network connectivity, and central to the modernization program, the Municipality should develop an IT strategy and implementation roadmap with a plan to acquire hardware, software, and network infrastructure that considers taking advantage of cloud-based solutions. However, pain points related to poor internet connectivity and speeds would need to be resolved in advance.	 Cloud use strategy including risk and performance requirements and vendor/contract considerations Operational applications selection approach and acquisition strategy (focus on data/reporting integration and operational support Office productivity along with records management solutions such as solutions such as SharePoint End user devices (tablets, laptops and desktops and mobile devices) LAN connectivity (wired, wireless and motspots) Cloud storage including back-up/recovery and automatic archiving 	 Reduced down-time and increased end-user productivity with automation and expected increased operational efficiency Improved planning and decision support with near real time tracking of action taking Access to cloud-based computing and SaaS, PaaS and IaaS solutions Dependencies Internet connectivity and lack of supporting IT architecture pain points must be resolved if the Municipality wishes to reasonably pursue a cloud-based records management technology solution.

2.	Infrastructure investment: One of the main challenges that was repeatedly mentioned during our consultations was that the Municipality currently doesn't have the proper IT infrastructure. To take advantage of many of modern system such as cloud computing and solutions that can be enabled by Software as a Service (SaaS) it is critical that the Municipality have high-speed reliable network connectivity.		Internet access Cloud-based solutions for finance (ERP systems) Community portals for online bookings to engage citizens	Dependencies (continued) Need to consider training and possible external support for IT strategy development along with a budget and a long-term investment plan (over 24 months)
3.	Change management plan: We have been told that currently, Municipal staff largely have developed their own individual practices as related to records organization, classification, and storage. As such, any significant efforts to modernize and change these practices, is likely to represent a significant disruptor to the day to day activities of these staff. To best ensure that the Municipality receives positive results from their records management modernization program and to minimize the negative impacts any significant organizational changes could have on staff, there should be a thorough change management plan developed and documented in advance. While having strategies and plans for the actual records management modernization efforts is significant and important, these strategies and plans assume a perfect adoption, ideal executions, adherence to timelines and budgets, and all roles being able to fulfill their responsibilities. As strategies and plans are executed and become integrated into the daily operations of an organization, the estimations and assumptions built in are often different than reality and there are so many factors that prevent plans from being executed as expected. An effective change management plan considers how to best manage the transition to a new operational state, including how to continually monitor it for success.	An con	effective change management plan should sider and demonstrate; The proposed reasons and benefits of the changes The scope of the changes The stakeholders and resources involved in implementing the changes Milestones, timelines, and costs Communication plan for both internal and external stakeholders Methods and tools to monitor the success of the changes and adoption of the changes	 Change management plans allow organizations to remain agile and adapt to challenges over the course of plan execution and change adoption. With a change management plan in place, the municipality will be able to plan and anticipate the effects that changes will have on all departments. Dependencies Any change management plan should be closely integrated with the records management modernization plan to ensure there is appropriate change management coverage over the various modernization initiatives

4. I	Records management modernization plan: Given the	Objectives of the modernization effort		A consolidated view of the various
r f	number of opportunity for improvement areas that the Municipality should action as part of a records management	Thresholds of success and targeted outcomes		initiatives to be pursued as part of the modernization effort, will allow the
r	modernization effort, and given that there are several	Identification and pursuit of solution		Municipality to effectively and efficiently
0	dependencies amongst pursuing addressing these various	options for records digitization and records		manage the scope, dependencies, timelines,
á	areas, the Municipality should develop, formalize, and	management Funding strategies		and costs associated with each of these
	captures each of these key initiatives and outlines related	Transformation/Modernization strategy and		A plan that adequately forecasts the level of
i	mplementation plans.	enablement roadmap that considers all		effort for each initiative, will allow the
		relevant initiatives		Municipality to properly resource so that
		each initiative that consider key		impacted.
		dependencies, timelines, costs, roles and		
		responsibilities, and internal resourcing	Dep	endencies
			sho	records management modernization program
			auto	omation of hard copy-based processes
			ine tech	procurement of a supporting information
			sho	uld be a key component of the modernization
			plar	n to be developed
			A re	cords management modernization program
			will	require a good change management and
			com	munication plan.
5. (CGSB Standards: As noted in the records inventory current	CGSB-72.34 Compliance Assessment		CGSB compliance may be too costly and unwarranted for all the Municipalities
	Services that are currently digitized with legal substance.			records. The most cost-effective strategy
1	The CANADIAN GENERAL STANDARDS BOARD (CGSB), is a			may be to identify records that are likely to
Ę	government agency that has developed national standards			be used in a court of law and where there is
	or electronic records as documentary evidence. CGSB			a risk that the record authenticity can be
r	need to be followed for electronic records to be considered			for those record types. There may for this
9	suitable and sufficient as legal evidence in court			reason also be regulatory requirements and
F	proceedings.			or legal requirements to retain paper
				originals. These paper records should be minimized to reduce inefficiencies
				וווווווווווווווווווווובפת נט רבתתנב ווובווונובוונובז.

The Municipality may wish to consider, in consultation with their legal advisors, determining whether compliance with CGSB-72.34 should be assessed to ensure that electronic records stored in digitized electronic form may be considered suitable and sufficient as legal evidence in court proceedings. Those records that may be involved in a court of law may be best to remain in a paper hardcopy form and while the can be digitized and stored for easy retrieval and search, the authoritative "original" may need to be stored safely in paper files that are aligned to electronic records using a standardized file system that has pointers to where these files are stored.		 It should be noted that any document that starts off as electronic that isn't signed by an individual is likely not a candidate for CGSB 72.34 compliance. Dependencies A standard file system and a data/records classification system should include those records that need to be retained for regulatory requirements and or legal requirements
6. Standardized classification schema: We heard that there is a lack of standardization when it comes to classification for records storage at the Municipality. We were told that in many instances, employees across departments have come up with their own methods to categorized and organize records. Without a standardized system for the classification of records, it becomes very difficult to organize and effectively store records in a structured way that other employees can understand for the utilization and retrieval of records. The Municipality should consider the development of a detailed data classification schema that is standardized across all departments. This can be documented in both a policy and/or directive that sets the requirements for records classification as well as supporting procedural documentation that describes exactly how employees should classify records during storage. The Municipality should consider the development of a policy that maps out the various departments, considers the type of data belonging to each, and subsequently classifies that data according to a set of parameters beneficial for the Municipality to be aware of in regards to the record types (integrity, confidentiality, availability, etc.).	Employees self-developed methods for categorization and organization of records should be identified and assessed	 With a standardized file system and data classification to support the protection and ease document retrieval, we expect an increase in the productivity of all municipal staff. A standardized data classification policy could be more easily developed if the Municipality first developed a data inventory that should be periodically maintained and captured: What data is used Where its available Where its located What access is permitted and to whom Integrity and security requirements for the type and nature of the data, including compliance requirements with current laws, by-laws, and regulations By setting requirements for classification across the Municipality, and then monitoring and enforcing compliance, departments will then be adhering to a standardized approach, which should reduce the pain point of numerous, ad-hoc approach by employees

Da pr fo	ata classification procedures can then be developed to rovide employees detailed steps to be executed when roceeding with the classification of records that they must ollow in order to meet the policy requirements.		DependenciesA data and records classification scheme starts by having a full and complete data/records inventory and then classifying that inventory based on the needs of each department and the Municipality as a whole. Sound policy, procedure and standard operating practices can help communicate and train Municipal staff. (a baseline records inventory has been developed as part of this engagement)Development of a data classification policy and supporting procedural documentation should be included as part of the documented records management modernization plan
7. Buth ho er dr no M pl m ur w fo pr w st ac op re sh w or as	usiness continuity and disaster recovery: It was noted that be Municipality has an Emergency Management Plan, owever it focuses more on supporting and addressing mergencies external to the Municipality (flooding, roughts, pandemics, etc.). It was discovered that there are o formalized policies or procedures in place from the lunicipal organization standpoint for business continuity anning or disaster recovery planning, which puts the nunicipality at risk of losing valuable information that is necoverable in the event of a disaster. There are some ays that electronic data is being backed up, but nothing is ormalized or documented. A business continuity plan is a roactive plan to avoid and mitigate the risks associated ith events that could disrupt operations. It details not only eps to take during an event but also steps to be taken in dvance and during the event in order to maintain the perations and overall viability of an organization. A disaster ecovery plan is a reactive plan on how an organization mould respond after disaster event has occurred. It deals ith safety of personnel, locations, and the protection of rganization assets. In the case of this engagement, these assets relate to the protection of organizational records.	 Business Continuity planning policy Disaster Recovery Policy IT Operations Policy Data security and protection policy 	 The Municipality will be in a better position to protect its assets. Reduce the impacts of negative events down to short term disruptions vs longer term, more significant shutdowns.

	Given that we heard from the Municipality that certain records are stored in building basements that are prone to flooding, the lack of a business continuity plan or disaster recovery plan is even more significant as these environments represent major risk to hard copy records. The Municipality should consider the development, formalization and documentation of both a business continuity plan and a disaster recovery plan.			
8.	Develop and implement document digitization strategy: As noted during our consultations, there are many inefficient paper-based processes that once converted to digital format will increase efficiency and reduce the need for excessive, redundant storage. Storing information electronically means that this information is easier to store, move, process, automate, retrieve and identify for archiving and back-up with copies.	Timesheet system Booking municipality facilities	Dep Nee mai	Increase of efficiency for those that use timesheet reporting (20 employees) Capturing information in a more timely, flexible and agile manner with greater accuracy, reduced transposition errors, and reduced manual work to copy information into numerous systems. pendencies ed to consider training and change nagement along with an IT strategy that wides a framework.

While we expect benefits and cost savings to be realized by the Municipality if these opportunities for improvement are addressed, there will be cost implications associated with actioning each. The following cost categories should be considered by the Municipality if they choose to develop and/or purchase solutions to addressing these opportunities for improvement:

One Time Costs

- Network infrastructure upgrade costs
- Internal labour fees associated with the development of plans, strategies, policies and procedures
- Third party labour fees
- Implementation costs from technology vendors

Ongoing Costs

- Fees for upgraded network connectivity
- Maintenance fees for upgraded network infrastructure
- Ongoing maintenance and service fees for any purchased technology solutions
- Ongoing operational costs associated with maintenance and updates to policy and procedures framework
- Internal operational costs associated with ramp up by Municipal employees adopting and adapting to new processes and technologies

4. Implementation Roadmap and Prioritization Framework

An implementation roadmap serves as a tool to help prioritize and plan to address the opportunities for improvement. This roadmap diagram below presents our recommend priority and sequencing for actioning the opportunities for improvement based upon the likely dependencies each of these opportunities for improvement will have on one another to be actioned successfully. The diagram organizes the opportunities for improvement each by either developing strategies and plans or improving records management capabilities and highlights the benefits to be realized if these opportunities are actioned.



Appendix A – Our Approach and Methodology

Organizations across all industries have used the Information Lifecycle Management framework to help better develop and align processes to managing valuable documents in a way that provides coverage over their entire lifecycle³. By implementing a standardized records management approach that considers effective technology usage and process implementation across all aspects of the records life cycle, organizations can improve access, better manage their compliance risk, gain long term cost savings, and improve organizational efficiency. The information lifecycle management approach allows organizations to keep track of their records while avoiding the storage of unnecessary records, and aids organizations in meeting regulatory compliance standards by identifying the records that need to be monitored for compliance purposes. The approach outlines that documents should be managed throughout their lifecycle with appropriate document protection controls in place to ensure that the records aren't damaged throughout processing. The image below gives an overview of the 5 stages of the Information Lifecycle used during our engagement. We used the Records Information Lifecycle Management utilized by the government of canada¹ as a baseline framework for our information lifecycle and tailored the approach to fit the context of this assessment as described below.



³ (Library and Archives Canada, 2018) <u>https://www.bac-lac.gc.ca/eng/services/government-information-resources/lifecycle-management/Pages/life-cycle-management.aspx</u>

Image 1 above demonstrates the various lifecycle stages that a record undergoes. The 5 stages are defined below:

- 1) **Collection, Creation, or Receipt of Record:** the record is collected, created, or received in a number of ways identified below
- 2) Organization & Classification: the record is organized according to a data classification scheme established by the organization.
- **3) Storage**: the record is stored either offsite or offline from operational systems to not burden the storage capacity of the operating system/office
- **4) Retrieval and Dissemination:** a record is retrieved from the storage site/inventory and disseminated to information users as needed.
- 5) Disposition and Destruction: the record is either destroyed or retired depending on it's future potential use (e.g. contains legal substance that could be used as evidence in court).

During the first stage of the record lifecycle, a record may be created within an organization in the following ways:

- Recording of a meeting (e.g. minutes of a meeting)
- Creating/processing a document used as a record
- Creating/sending an email
- Entering a transaction into a system
- Receipt of document/spreadsheet/email

We conducted a third-party review of the Municipality's current retention by-laws and filing strategies. The Municipality's departments involved with the assessment included:

- **Corporate Services and Administration**
- Treasury
- Public Works
- Community Development and Recreation
- Fire Department
- Tax Services
- By-Law Council

In order to collect the information that was needed, we started by performing an in-depth review of relevant by laws and policies to gain a deeper understanding of the processes prior to delving into workshops and interviews. Following the document review, we conducted remote interviews with the Treasurer to validate the preliminary findings and gain additional context to support the development of a records inventory and a cost analysis. In addition to the remote interviews, we performed on site cross-functional workshops with various members of teams across the municipality. Throughout these workshops, we leveraged the Records Information Lifecycle as explained above (See Annex 1 of this Appendix for the template tool). These workshops in conjunction with the use of the framework allowed us to gain insight to requirements, pain points, and opportunities for improvement.

The next step was to leverage the document review of the retention bylaw and the information collected from the interviews and the workshops with various stakeholders in order to develop a

records inventory. As a part of our analysis, we asked that the Municipality's stakeholders fill in the records inventory tool and define the number/volume of records they currently own within each department. This records inventory allowed us to have a better view of the current state of inventory of record filings. This tool (high-level template showed in (Annex 2 of this Appendix) allowed us to better understand where any inefficiencies and pain points/risks lie within the business process, capture of requirements for the desired future state of the records lifecycle, and identify opportunities for improvement.

In a separate data collection and validation exercise we were able to collect information on the direct and indirect costs allocated towards their current records management processes and calculate an estimate of the total annual costs associated with their current processes. This assessment estimated that almost one third of the Municipality's current wages are spent just on their records management processes. A detailed breakdown of the assumptions and cost estimation methodology can be found in Appendix D.

As a part of our assessment, we developed a records classification inventory and cost estimation tool that allowed us to get a better view of the current state of inventory of record filings and the costs allocated towards each stage of the record information lifecycle. This tool (high-level template showed in **Annex 1 of this Appendix**) also helped provide an overview of the current records lifecycle stages executed at the Municipality. This allowed us to better understand where any inefficiencies and pain points/risks lie within the business process, capture of requirements for the desired future state of the records lifecycle, and identify opportunities for improvement.

Prior to conducting the workshops, we reviewed the retention by-law policies and organization chart, and held interviews with the CAO/Treasurer of the Municipality and performed an in-depth document review to gain an understanding of the current processes leading into the workshops.

Through data collection exercises conducted with the Municipality's CAO/Treasurer and the workshops conducted with the Municipality's internal stakeholders (Referenced in **Appendix C**), we collected information as related to the stages of the information lifecycle by the following categories:

- Baseline costs: a total estimate of direct costs (paper supplies, shredding services, storage, etc..) and indirect costs (time currently spent by staff on records management processes)
- **Requirements:** any specific legislation, regulations, standards, or policies that mandate the retention of media through which information/documents must be stored.
- Pain points: challenges that stakeholders experience across the record's information lifecycle processes that have a potential impact on service delivery
- Opportunities for improvement: opportunities for the organization to improve current processes and become more efficient

The information collected during those workshops helped us analyse the current state of the records filing processes and analyze their current records inventory. In a separate data collection and validation exercise we were able to collect information on the direct and indirect costs allocated towards their current records management processes and calculate an estimate of the total annual costs associated with their current processes. This assessment estimated that almost one third of the Municipality's current wages are spent just on their records management processes. A detailed breakdown of the assumptions and cost estimation methodology can be found in **Appendix D**.

Within the records inventory and cost estimation tool created, we requested that the Municipality fill in with information on their current records inventory (can be found in Annex 1 and 2 of this Appendix). gives a brief overview of the outline used for current state assessment of the records inventory. After collecting the information outlined, we were able to analyze the information and quantify the number of records within each of the following categories:

- Hard copy: the record type is retained as a paper-based hardcopy
- Electronic: the record that is scanned or otherwise captured from a hardcopy version at any point during the record lifecycle has potential legal implications
- Digitized (with legal substance): the record that is scanned or otherwise captured from a hardcopy version at any point during the record lifecycle has potential legal implications
- Digitized (without legal substance): the record that is scanned or otherwise captured from a hardcopy version at any point during the record lifecycle has no potential legal implications

As a part of our analysis, we asked that the Municipalities stakeholders fill in the records inventory tool and define the number/volume of records they currently own within each department. The volume of records was defined as a range of record "sets" as per below:

- Below 100 records
- Between 100-500 records
- Between 500 1000 records
- Above 1000 records

ANNEX 1 – Appendix A: Template Tool

Information Lifecycle	1. Collection, Creation, or Receipt of Record	2. Organization & Classification	3. Storage	4. Retrieval & Dissemination	5. Disposition / Destruction
Total Costs*					
Requirements					
Pain Points					
Opportunities for Improvement					

Table 1. Information Lifecycle Activities

*Total costs represent direct and indirect costs incurred during each stage and are presented in further detail in Appendix D

ANNEX 2 - Appendix A: Records Inventory Tool

Records Inventory							
Document Category	Record Type	Volume of records	Retention Requirement	Owner	Repository	Source of Record	Notes
Hard copy							
Electronic							
Digitized (with legal substance)							
Digitized (without legal substance)							

Table 2. Records Inventory Tool

Appendix B – Glossary of Terms

The following are a list of terms and acronym used throughout the report

Term	Definition
Information Lifecycle	Set of activities that manage the lifecycle of information from creation to final disposition.
Layer	Refers to the rows under each of the activity.
Outputs	Key deliverables and work products developed as part of conducting the acidity.
Pain Points	Issues, problems or challenges causing "pain" in the organization and requiring a solution.
Opportunities for Improvement	Areas to change, focus attention and transform.
Metrics	Key indicators that track progress and are thresholds to monitor (KPIs, KRIs, etc.)
Outcomes	The benefits or value accomplished as a result of the delivery of core activities

Appendix C – Detailed Information Lifecycle Table

Current State Information Lifecycle								
Information Lifecycle Activities	1. Collection, creation, or receipt of records	2. Organization and classification of records	3. Storage	4. Retrieval and dissemination	5. Disposition/destruction			
Requirements Summarizes requirements that need to be considered for certain types of records across each phase of	Requirement 1: By-Laws and policies have to be approved, signed using ink signature and be kept as a hard-copy indefinitely		Requirement 1: By-Laws and policies have to be approved, signed using ink signature and be kept as a hard-copy indefinitely					
the records lifecycle. (i.e. laws, regulations, standards,	Marriage and death records are retained in a ledger indefinitely		Marriage and death records are retained in a ledger indefinitely		Requirement 2: Marriage and death records are retained in a ledger indefinitely			
etc.)			Requirement 3: Tax certificates need to be kept for 7 years		Requirement 3: Tax certificates need to be kept for 7 years			
	Requirement 4: Timesheets need to be signed off by managers, and stored for an appropriate time period so that external auditors can review them		Requirement 4: Timesheets need to be signed off by managers, and stored for an appropriate time period so that external auditors can review them	Requirement 4: Timesheets need to be signed off by managers, and stored for an appropriate time period so that external auditors can review them	Requirement 4: Timesheets need to be signed off by managers, and stored for an appropriate time period so that external auditors can review them			
	Requirement 5: With respect to the Fire Department, all data logs for report incidents are stored for an appropriate time period. The fire chief would need to retain this evidence for possible use in court		Requirement 5: With respect to the Fire Department, all data logs for report incidents are stored for an appropriate time period. The fire chief would need to retain this evidence for possible use in court	Requirement 5: With respect to the Fire Department, all data logs for report incidents are stored for an appropriate time period. The fire chief would need to retain this evidence for possible use in court	Requirement 5: With respect to the Fire Department, all data logs for report incidents are stored for an appropriate time period. The fire chief would need to retain this evidence for possible use in court			

-	Requirement 6: Physical Signatures are needed to sign off on monthly water sampling report that's created Requirement 7:	Requirement 7.	
	A certified copy of by-laws needs to be made with an indent stamp of the municipal logo once complete and stored permanently.	A certified copy of by-laws needs to be made with an indent stamp of the municipal logo once complete and stored permanently.	Requirement 7: A certified copy of by-laws needs to be made with an indent stamp of the municipal logo once complete and stored permanently.

Pain Points	Pain Point 1: It	Pain Point 1: It		
	was noted that	was noted that		
Summarizes	several of the	several of the		
major pain	records filing	records filing		
points	processes have	processes have		
discussed	not been	not been		
during the	modernized and	modernized and		
workshop	standardized	standardized		
sessions.	across the	across the		
	different	different		
	departments	departments		
	involved with	involved with		
	the records	the records		
	management	management		
	process.	process.		
	Employees have	Employees have		
	their own file	their own file		
	on the drive and	on the drive and		
	their own way	their own way		
	to store files.	to store files.		
			Pain Point 2:	
			Currently there	
			are no formal	
			policies/	
			procedures	
			around business	
			continuity and	
			disaster recover	
			planning with	
			regards to	
			retrieval of	
			records in case	
			of a natural or	
			human-induced	
			disaster.	

	Pain Point 3.		
	With respect to		
	the Fire		
	Doportmont		
	ophytical and the second secon		
	only two		
	computers have		
	the Fire Pro		
	application that		
	tracks their		
	incident		
	records. Notes		
	are handwritten		
	and re-keyed		
	into Fire Pro		
	application on		
	these		
	computers		
	when the main		
	when the main		
	users are not at		
	their		
	workstations.		
	Pain Point 4: On		
	the tax side, the		
	accounting		
	software is at		
	capacity in		
	terms of the		
	amount of data		
	that they have		
	, in the		
	Accounting		
	system which		
	system, which		
	scall manually		
	complete a		
	repair and		
	compact of		
	records		
	frequently. The		
	system is		
	crashing often		
	because the		
	system is		
	overloaded.		
		Pain Point 6:	
Pain Point 5:	Pain Point 5:	Income tax	
Income tax	Income tax	receipts have to	
receipts from	receipts from	be located	
donations come	donations come	manually which	
in the form of a	in the form of a	is time	
cheque, which	cheque, which	consuming and	
is photocopied	is photocopied	docroases	
to process later	to process later		
on. There is	on. There is	efficiency. This	
often not	often not	can be address	
enough	enough	by	
information or	information or	implementing a	
too much	too much	detailed,	
information	information	standardized	
mormation	mormation	record	

stored in the		stored in the	classification	
records.		records.	schema.	
	Pain Point 7:	Pain Point 7:	Pain Point 7:	
	Emails are	Emails are	Emails are	
	printed, and	printed, and	printed, and	
	they are kept in	they are kept in	they are kept in	
	different files.	different files.	different files.	
	No limit for	No limit for	No limit for	
	emails that are	emails that are	emails that are	
	being kept on	being kept on	being kept on	
	filed into	filed into	filed into	
	whatever	whatever	whatever	
	subject they are	subject they are	subject they are	
	related to.	related to.	related to.	
	There are two	There are two	There are two	
	different file	different file	different file	
	systems. This	systems. This	systems. This	
	process leads to	process leads to	process leads to	
	inefficiencies in	inefficiencies in	inefficiencies in	
	retrieval.	retrieval.	retrieval.	
		Pain Point 8:		
		stored in a hard		
		copy as a binder		
		in multiple		
		locations and		
		many policies		
		have not been		
		updated since		
		2006.		
There are many				
naper-based				
processes (e.g.				
timesheets, Fire				
Log reports,				
facility/hall				
booking				
systems) that				
can be				
automated.				
Tweed received				
electronic		Pain Point 11		
invoices which		Verv little		
are then printed		records are		Pain Point 11: Very little
and stored as		disposed, and		records are disposed, and
hard copies.		certain records		certain records are
This process of		are maintained		maintained in hard copy and
duplication is		in hard copy		electronic forms longer than
also used for		and electronic		required.
energy		forms longer		
reporting to the		than required.		
province. This				
Causes				

inefficiencies in				
terms of				
increased costs				
and time				
consumption				
Pain Point 12: Asi	de from a retention	policy, there are no	ot any defined recor	ds management policies or
procedures.		Doin Doint 12		
		Hard conv		
		records are		
		stored across		
		multiple rooms.		
		including		
		multiple records		
		rooms and		
		multiple offices		
		and there is no		
		clear way to		
		identify the		
		specific records		
		that exist in		
		room		
		Pain Point 14:		
		Records rooms		
		located in the		
		basement are		
		not climate		
		controlled and		
		there are		
		common		
		flooding which		
		could risk		
		damaging		
		records.		
		Pain Point 15:		
		Redundant		
		storage -		
		records are		
		stored in		
		multiple places		
		through		
		multiple forms		
Pain Point 16: The	ere is poor internet	connectivity in the N	Municipality's main	office. Symptoms of the poor
internet connectio	ons include, frequer	it network down tin	nes and software cra	ashing.

Desired future state/oppor tunities to transform	Observed Opportunity for Improvement 1: Establish modernization program aligned to a province roll out strategy						
	Observed Opportunity for Improvement 2: Develop a policy framework with a maintenance approach						
Summarizes the key opportuniti	Observed Opportunity for Improvement 3: Develop a change management initiative while considering organizational culture and operating context						

es for improveme nt noted during the work sessions.	Observed Opportunity for Improvement 4: Develop an IT infrastructure strategy to improve network connectivity and computing capacity to take advantage of modern computing (e.g. cloud - based applications, software as a service, infrastructure as a service, wireless and remote working, etc.)
	Observed Opportunity for Improvement 5: Implement IT infrastructure plan
	Observed Opportunity for Improvement 6: Develop an implement a detailed classification schema
	Observed Opportunity for Improvement 7: Select technology to be leveraged for records management system. This system could be used for cataloguing hard copies as well as cataloguing and storing electronic copies
	Observed Opportunity for Improvement 8: Document digitization plan and strategy, which involves organizing the historical records to be digitized (in accordance to records scheme)

Appendix D – Cost Estimation Breakdown

Information Lifecycle Activities	1. Collection, creation, or receipt of records	2. Organization and classification of records	3. Storage	4. Retrieval and dissemination	5. Disposition/destruction	Total	Assumptions
Direct Costs (Annual bas	sed on monthly aver	age)					
Paper supplies	\$3,768			\$5,095		\$8,863	All figures were rounded to account for decimal points
Printing/scanning	\$3,010			\$3,010		\$6,020	
Ink	\$791			\$791		\$1,582	
Shredding					\$946	\$946	
Software	\$9,604	\$3,443	\$3,443	\$3,443		\$19,933	
Record Creation Tools	\$610					\$610	
Storage	\$51		\$51			\$102	
Any other direct costs		\$5,112	\$6,698	\$2,914		\$14,724	
Total Direct Costs	\$17,834	\$8555	\$10,192	\$15,253	\$946	\$52,780	
Indirect Costs (allocatio	n of Salary and wage	es based on estimated	d hours spent acro	oss the information l	ifecycle)		
Annual time spent based on daily average (assume 248 days/year)		Assumed that there a doesn't account for v	are 248 working da acations, or any le	ays in 2019 across all eave of absence.	departments. This accour	nts for stat. holidays,	and weekends, but

Treasury Department	818	496	818	496	62
Parks and Recreation Department	496	248	124	248	83
Fire Department	310	186	744	248	21
Tax/Property Department	496	310	496	620	42
Public Works	496	248	248	744	21

							on a daily average by 248 working days
Parks and Recreation Department	496	248	124	248	83	1,199	
Fire Department	310	186	744	248	21	1,509	
Tax/Property Department	496	310	496	620	42	1,964	
Public Works Department	496	248	248	744	21	1,757	Given that it takes 1-5 hours for retrieval the average was assumed to be 3 hours
Corporate Services Department	1,488	744	868	1,116	61.33	4,277	Given that disposal is only done once annually taking 16 to 24 hours to sort and pull information the average effort was assumed to be around 20 hours annually + 10 mins daily
Allocation of Salary/Wag	ge cost based on an	nual time spent (mo	nthly salary inform	ation provided and	assumed to be uniform	over a 12-month pe	riod)
Treasury Department	\$23,431	\$14,200	\$23,431	\$14,200	\$1,775	\$77,038	
Parks and Recreation Department	\$9,285	\$4,643	\$2,321	\$4,643	\$1,548	\$22,439	

2,690

Derived figures by

multiplying the number of hours spent

Total Cost Allocation	\$150,953	\$80,886	\$125,641	\$132,223	\$9,402	\$499,102	
Total Indirect Cost Allocation	\$133,119	\$72,330	\$115,449	\$116,970	\$ <i>8,456</i>	\$446,322	
Corporate Services Department	\$51,396	\$25,698	\$29,981	\$38,547	\$2,118	\$147,739	
Public Works Department	\$19,776	\$9,888	\$9,888	\$29,663	\$824	\$70,038	
Tax/Property Department	\$14,518	\$9,074	\$14,518	\$18,147	\$1,210	\$57,467	
Fire Department	\$14,713	\$8,828	\$35,310	\$11,770	\$981	\$71,601	Assumed total hourly cost of 47.46

Appendix E – List of Internal Stakeholders Involved

Position	Department/Team
CAO/Treasurer	Corporate Services/Treasury
Clerk/Deputy Treasurer	Corporate Services/Treasury
Manager of Public Works	Public Works/Waste
Manager of Community Development/Parks & Recreation	Community Development/Recreation
Fire Chief	Fire Department
Deputy Clerk/Corporate Services Assistant	Corporate Services
Landfill Supervisor	Waste
Recreation Supervisor	Recreation
Fire Prevention Officer	Fire
By-Law Enforcement Officer	By-Law
Tax & Property Assistant	Тах
Treasury Assistant	Treasury
Administration/ Public Works Assistant	Corporate Services/Public Works/Treasury